

sleep. It lay about in a state of torpor, and at night severe diarrhoea set in. The woman in charge had to get up to the animal about ten or twelve times during the night. It would crouch around without achieving the end sought, and moreover there was a stench from the mouth. It indicated a typical potency of D.4, which was effective.

DR. FUSSEL, who said that her experience had been entirely with animals, declared that in chronic cases the low potencies must be used first and not the high ones, or a violent reaction would follow. Some animals did not seem to react to homœopathic remedies at all, but if the physiological basis were first followed they would be found to respond, and if then put on homœopathic remedies a good result would be obtained.

DR. HANCOCK, who was invited to reply to the discussion, said that he was much obliged for the interesting contributions, but he would prefer to give his time to another colleague who was waiting to speak.

—*The British Homœopathic Journal, Jan., '57*

HOMŒOPATHIC MEDICAL BILL

Speeches of Hon'ble Dr. B. C. Roy and Dr. J. N. Mazumdar,
M.L.A. on the W. Bengal Homœopathic Medical Bill 1959,
on the floor of W. Bengal Legislative Assembly
delivered on 25. 3. 59.

Dr. Jnanendra Nath Mazumdar :

Sir, I beg leave to introduce the West Bengal Homœopathic Bill, 1959.

The Hon'ble Dr. Bidhan Chandra Roy :

Sir, I may mention the fact—this is the time I should mention it—that I had a talk with Dr. Majumdar. This particular

bill refers to Homœopathy. There is not the slightest doubt that Homœopathy has held its own in spite of different types of medical treatment and perhaps in some respect, Bengal had very big Homœopaths in the past and also in the present. The question is whether there should be a medical bill to regulate the practice of Homœopathy in Bengal. Our difficulty had been that the different organisations that have been started by the Homœopathic practitioners—and here I may digress and say that it is to the credit of medical practitioners of Allopathy, Homœopathy and Kaviraji, Bengal, that it is the practitioners themselves who have established the institutions and carried them on with great effect—that in order that the bill may be effective, that is to say, those who will be registered under the Homœopathic Medical Bill and therefore would be entitled to give certificates and prescribe certain drugs etc., it is necessary that these men who belonged to the Homœopathic institutions and who are being trained in the Homœopathic system of medicine should have fundamental knowledge of Anatomy and Physiology. While the treatment may be different and has to be different, the approach to diseases and the system of treatment to be given in certain cases have to be different. The fundamental knowledge of what the human body is and what are the functions of the different parts of the body, should be first of all, taught in these medical institutions. I have tried for the last few years to get some of these friends together and talk to me. But I could not discern any particular attempt to accept this fundamental principle, viz., that Anatomy and Physiology must be taught. I heard from Dr. Majumdar the other day and I heard with great hope that they have now agreed—if I am wrong Dr. Majumdar will please correct me—they have now agreed, if not all, some of the important institutions, to give the trainee instruction in Anatomy and Physiology so as to enable the trainee to understand the background. Probably a certain amount of knowledge of the diseased conditions also may be included, viz., Pathology, so that the practitioner may then be able to find out what the treatment of a particular disease should be and where the Homœopathic practitioner would see that this is not my area, somebody else may come

in and do the job. I find from my Minister of Health Dr. Anath Bandhu Roy, that he has drawn up a Homœopathic Bill in order to give effect to the idea that I have just given. I do not know whether in detail all those points that have been raised by Dr. Majumdar in his draft bill agree with the draft bill drawn up by Dr. Roy. But I feel that in view of the fact—if I can assume that it is a fact—that fundamentally we agree, the practitioners of the other systems of medicine and Homœopathic medicine agree, that there should be some fundamental knowledge of the basic sciences and leave the Homœopathic practitioners to give instructions in the system of treatment according to their own line of thought. Do they agree on that? The question of having an effective bill passed so that the work may be done systematically should not be very difficult.

I am prepared, therefore, to give my services, for what it is worth, to get in together the gentlemen who may be asked by Dr. Roy to come in a meeting and also Dr. Majumdar and any of his friends—he mentioned to me three or four if I remember aright—who are prepared to give help in drawing up a bill which would be satisfactory for all concerned.

In these considerations I would suggest, I would request Dr. Majumdar to consider this particular point of view and whether it would not be better for him to withdraw this bill at this state, seeing that Dr. Roy has already got a bill in hand.

(English version of Dr. J. N. Majumdar's speech in Bengali).

Dr. J. N. Majumdar :

Hon'ble Speaker, Sir, I thank our Chief Minister as he has declared that a committee will be formed to discuss about and draw up a Homœopathic Bill and to scrutinise the Syllabus of studies framed and followed by the General Council and State Faculty of Homœopathic Medicine, West Bengal. And I want to touch upon a few facts in this connection.

The first thing I beg to point out here, is that I regret to say that the statements made by our Hon'ble Chief Minister in connection with Homœopathic teaching are not all correct. The Homœopathic State Faculty was set up by the Govt. of Bengal as early as 1941 i.e. about 18 years ago. The Homœopathic

system of Medicine having attained wide popularity in the province it was considered by the then Govt. of Bengal in the interest of the public to regulate Homœopathic teaching and practice as per Resolution No. 1568/Medical of the 24th June 1941 published in the Calcutta Gazette. In the event of the Govt. not undertaking any financial responsibility the members of the Homœopathic profession collected funds from amongst themselves to bear the expenses involved in the setting up of the Homœopathic Faculty and running the said body from day to day. And even now the said Faculty does not receive any financial help from the present Govt. of West Bengal. The syllabus of studies of Homœopathic and non-homœopathic subjects which has been framed by the Faculty, has been duly ratified by the Govt. of West Bengal. Even a cursory look at the said Syllabus of studies is enough to find that the basic sciences viz., Anatomy, Physiology and Pathology and the other subjects like Surgery, Obstetrics and Gynæcology and Practice of Medicine etc. the study of which helps to turn out a complete physician—are all included there. Our Govt. must be in the know of this as it has been duly published on more than one occasion by Gazette notification for public information. The result is that not only the public is benefitted by the medical services rendered by properly trained Homœopathic practitioners but also subjects like Medical Jurisprudence and Hygiene being included in the Syllabus it has become possible for those practitioners to acquire minimum qualifications, at least, to appear in the Court of law in medico-legal cases and to act as medical officers in Life Assurance Cases.

The Syllabus of studies fixed by our Homœopathic Faculty and followed in the institutions affiliated to it—has also been recommended by the "Dave Committee" set up by the Govt. of India; and this very Syllabus with slight additions has been approved by the Central Govt. of India for the proposed Degree Course in Homœopathy. Even under these circumstances if our Govt. wants to scrutinise our Syllabus once again—I have no objection thereto, and I have previously intimated my consent to our Chief Minister.

In August 1950 Sri J. C. Gupta proposed to introduce a

Homœopathic Bill in the West Bengal Legislative Assembly. Our Chief Minister declared that on principle he had no objection to have the said Bill introduced but as his Govt. had not yet considered the Bill from all necessary aspects he suggested Sri Gupta to withdraw the Bill and assured him and the House that a suitable Bill will be brought forward on behalf of his Govt. in the next Session of the Assembly. But alas! seven long years have passed by and our Govt. have not yet found its way to introduce any Homœopathic Bill. In the meantime Dr. Narayan Roy, on behalf of the Communist Party, introduced a Homœopathic Bill in 1955. It was put to vote and lost in favour of the Govt. Party; but our Chief Minister again assured the House that a Bill would be introduced by the Govt. in the next Assembly Session. But four years have since elapsed with nothing doing. Sir, I don't want a division or voting on my bill. It is my firm conviction that legislative enactment of this Bill will be conducive to public benefit. My request to our Chief Minister is that he may not defer the enactment of this Bill any longer. He is a notable personality in the medical profession and I am also practising medicine for the last three generations. I want to get this Bill passed as I know full well that the public will be benefitted by the legislative enactment of this Homœopathic Bill. I will be the last person to be associated with anything that goes against public interest. The Hon'ble Chief Minister is my senior and my "Guru" (preceptor); and he commands far more experience than what I do. If he still wants to scrutinise the Syllabus once again—I am agreeable to it.

I want to impress on him that the Homœopathic practitioners do not deserve all the blame that is put on their shoulders. In case of the Govt. spending seven crores of rupees for the running of the Allopathic teaching institutions and only a paltry sum of forty thousand rupees for the cause of Homœopathy, which, in its turn, is not yet officially recognised, the qualitative standard of Homœopathic practitioners who are turned out from our institutions cannot be any better than what it is now. Still I must draw the attention of the House to the fact that many of them have earned sufficient reputation in practice both here

and in other States. In this connection I want to inform Dr. Roy that in case the Homœopathic Bill is passed in our State there is every possibility of bringing into existence a fully-equipped Homœopathic Medical College and Hospital with the Homœopathic talents available here; and we can secure a grant of Rupees thirty-seven and a half lakhs from the Central Govt. of India. Let us not be deprived of this much financial assistance from the Centre. The U.P. State has already secured Rupees Four and a half lakhs for Homœopathy and the Central Govt. has already decided to grant ten lakhs of rupees to U.P. during the Second Five Year Plan period. The Andhra State has received a grant of two and a half lakhs of rupees. In this way the sum allotted for Homœopathy will go to other states and nothing will be left for us in West Bengal. I think there is only one place in the world, namely Calcutta where properly qualified Homœopathic practitioners are available as professors for Anatomy, Physiology, Pathology, Surgery, Midwifery and Gynæcology, Practice of Medicine, Medical Jurisprudence etc. Even the Allopathic practitioners admit that they are fit persons to teach those subjects. Nowhere in the world such an arrangement is possible in Homœopathic institutions. Legislative enactments regarding Homœopathy have been passed in U.P., Andhra etc. but proper arrangements for running the institutions could not be made due to want or paucity of properly qualified teachers. It is a matter of great pity to have no legislative enactment as yet in a place where such an arrangement could possibly be made. And we of West Bengal are losing much thereby. A rumour has gained currency to the effect that our Chief Minister, who is himself a great Allopath, has stated on one occasion before the members of his party that so long he is living and remains the Chief Minister he will see that State recognition is not accorded to Homœopathy. If this is true I must state with great regret that such an attitude is not at all scientific and fits ill in the mouth of a great scientist like him. I beg to make this submission to him that if he takes the trouble of going through the preamble of the Govt. notification regarding the inception of our General Council and State Faculty of Homœopathic Medicine, as published in the

Calcutta Gazette—I am not speaking this as a Homœopathic practitioner but as a member of the public—that the Govt. acceptance of the fact that Homœopathy has attained wide popularity is recorded therein. I hasten to add the onus of death of people under treatment of those Homœopathic practitioners (who are not institutionally trained) through their acts of omission and commission during treatment—rests on our Govt. because those physicians might be good Homœopathic therapeutists but did not have the privilege of being trained as complete physicians owing to failure of the Govt. to provide for their adequate teaching facilities. However, for some reasons or other, best known to the Govt. some lip sympathy to Homœopathy is shown by the Govt. I earnestly request our Govt. through the Chief Minister to constitute a Committee to draw up a Homœopathic Bill and introduce it in the West Bengal Legislative Assembly at its earliest opportunity. With these remarks I beg leave to withdraw the Bill introduced by me, this afternoon.

LETTERS TO THE EDITOR

(1)

Dear Editor,

Doctor Hutchinson, who has described peculiarities of teeth, diagnostic of hereditary syphilis, and known as Hutchinson's teeth or test-teeth, was the first doctor to discover that syphilis was transferred through vaccination with human lymph. Considering the facts that "Latent Syphilis often exists where it is least expected" and that even Allopaths admit the presence of latent syphilis even when it cannot be detected by tests, is it not likely that recourse to blood transfusion, which has become the fashion of the day, helps to spread syphilis and other latent taints from men to men?